

Our Ref: 717-195

5 October 2017



Port Hedland Dust Management Taskforce
Department of Jobs, Tourism, Science and Innovation
Level 6, 1 Adelaide Terrace
EAST PERTH WA 6004

Email: porthedlanddust@jtsi.wa.gov.au

Dear Sir/ Madam,

**SUBMISSION - PORT HEDLAND DUST MANAGEMENT TASKFORCE REPORT TO GOVERNMENT –
RECOMMENDATION 6**

The following submission has been prepared by TPG+Place Match (TPG) town planners on behalf of the Esplanade Port Hedland Hotel Land Pty Ltd (referred to throughout as the Esplanade Hotel) in relation to Recommendation 6 of the Port Hedland Dust Management Taskforce Report to Government (August 2016). This is one of two separate submissions prepared by TPG in relation to the proposed recommendations and supplements a separate series of submissions.

As stated in our separate submission in relation to Recommendation 5, our primary concern is that the current recommendations of the Taskforce Report unreasonably place the onus on the community of Port Hedland to bear the costs associated with pollution caused predominantly by Port users. Only one of the seven recommendations place any onus on polluters to control their emissions and there is no recommendation that indicates that industry should achieve or work towards achieving 'best-practice' dust management. Instead the current recommendations seek to impose restrictions which will further negatively impact on the amenity and property values of the West End, and place the burden of cleaning up dust on the Town and its residents and ratepayers, while Port users continue to generate enormous profits, despite these users being overwhelmingly responsible for the high dust levels over Port Hedland.

Recommendation 6 of the Dust Taskforce report currently reads as follows:

- *The Town of Port Hedland works with key stakeholders to identify and mitigate dust from non-industry sources, with a focus on:*
 - *Identifying and implementing dust mitigation options for the spoil bank;*
 - *Sealing unsealed roads and undertaking regular and effective street sweeping operations;*
 - *Considering greening options, including coastal dune revegetation and the establishment of a green belt around the port; and*
 - *Reviewing and improving the efficacy of municipal services associated with dust control.*

Various reports have confirmed that so-called 'background' dust is only a small contributor to the high dust levels experienced in Port Hedland (refer to separate Aurora submission), with Port activities being the key source of the issues being experienced in and around the West End. Even dust monitoring undertaken on the

Spoilbank itself on behalf of LandCorp indicated that the dust concern was from dust generated largely from Finucane Island These Port dust sources must remain the clear focus for best practice dust amelioration.

Many of so-called 'background' sources of dust are also actually indirectly related to Port and industry operations. For example, dust on sealed roads in the West End stirred up by vehicles would largely come from Port operations, and the Spoilbank is not a natural landform, but one created by dredging from the Port itself.

In principle, we agree that the activities referenced in Recommendation 6 should be undertaken, however the Town of Port Hedland is cash poor and is not the polluter contributing to the high levels of dust. The Town and its rate payers should therefore not be responsible for paying the costs associated with addressing 'background' dust, which is clearly only a very minor contributor to the issues being experienced in the West End. In seeking to push these costs onto the Town (of course ultimately the ratepayers of Port Hedland including the property and business owners of the West End), this is another example of the current Dust Taskforce recommendations seeking to place the burden of cleaning up dust caused by Port activities on the Town and its residents and ratepayers.

It is also noted that Recommendation 6 does not currently refer to dust generated from vacant properties within the West End, many of which are owned by BHP (Refer to Appendix 1 - BHP Ownership in the West End of Port Hedland). Many of these vacant properties are unfenced and unvegetated, having simply been cleared leaving exposed bare ground, another source of 'background' dust. Revegetating, fencing or indeed redeveloping these properties would also assist in managing 'background' dust.

Proposed Alternative Recommendation

We propose the following as an alternative to Recommendation 6:

- *Any Port user seeking to increase its throughput from the Port should be required to offset the risk of increased environmental impacts by contributing funding to a Trust Fund administered by the Town of Port Hedland together with a representative body drawn from residents, land owners and business owners in the West End. The Trust fund to be used for the following purposes:*
 - *Mitigation of background dust sources such as the Spoilbank;*
 - *Planting of irrigated landscaped buffers around and within the Port;*
 - *Regular sweeping of accumulated dust deposits;*
 - *Cleaning and painting of building facades; and*
 - *Creating and enforcing a local law requiring regular dust suppression revegetation or development of vacant properties and, where these properties are owned by Port users, imposing a Special Area Rate on vacant properties to encourage their redevelopment and use.*

The redevelopment of the Spoilbank for a marina development has the potential to further reduce 'background' dust levels, and it would significantly contribute to the amenity and vitality of the West End. The State Government's support and funding for this project is also respectfully requested. We have prepared and submitted separate submission to specifically address this matter.

We thank the Minister for Regional Development for the opportunity to comment on the Recommendations put forward by the Dust Taskforce Report, and respectfully request that Recommendation 6 be rejected and replaced by the proposed alternative recommendation to emphasise that, as industry is overwhelmingly responsible for the high dust levels over Port Hedland, they must also be responsible for any mitigation measures, rather than the Town and its ratepayers.

Should you have any queries in relation to the above, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned on 9289 8300.

Yours sincerely
TPG+PLACE MATCH

A black rectangular redaction box covers the signature of David Read. The signature is written in cursive and is partially obscured by the redaction.

David Read
Director

APPENDIX 1

BHP OWNERSHIP IN THE WEST END OF PORT HEDLAND

BHP - Ownership in West End Port Hedland

Lot	Street Number	Street Name	Description	Owner(s)	Plan (P) / Diagram (D) / Strata Plan (SP)	Date of last ownership transfer	Consideration
1	100	Adjacent to 16	The Esplanade	Community Shop	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	D34764	2002 \$130,000
2	30	1	Wedge Street	BHP Office	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2004 \$1,010,000
3	123	10	Kingsmill Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2011 2,290,000
4	79	3	Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2004 \$1,010,000
5	1 3A		Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	D16134	2011 \$2,290,000
6	200	25	Richardson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P300241	2004 \$1,010,000
7	248	66	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
8	342		Wilson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P165816	2001 \$0
9	96	29	Kingsmill Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2011 \$0
10	320	34	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
11	402	93	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
12	403	95	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
13	499	39	Moore Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P209009	2011 \$975,000
14	183	59	Kingsmill Street	Flats	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223066	2004 \$0
15	53	6	McKay Street	Carpark / Industrial	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2004 \$160,000
16	115	23	Anderson Street	Liquor Store	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2012 \$4,200,000
17	236	7	Wilson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P144219	2001 \$0
18	47	7	Edgar Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2012 \$2,200,000
19	1 5 to 7		Hardie Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	D56855	2011 \$2,100,000
20	66	5	Richardson Street	Car Park	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2001 \$0
21	947		Wilson Street	Vacant/Bush	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P172354	2001 \$0
22	169		Wilson Street	Vacant/Bush	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P144219	\$0
23	194	45	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223066	2005 \$205,000
24	116	21	Anderson Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2012 \$4,200,000
25	127	2	Kingsmill Street	Commercial	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2004 \$600,000
26	125	6	Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2004 \$520,000
27	126	4	Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2004 \$520,000
28	237		Wilson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P144219	2001 \$0
29	754	116	Anderson Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P209879	2003 \$150,000
30	2	25	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	D56855	2011 \$1,690,000
31	209	67	Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223066	2004 \$465,000
32	12	4	Wedge Street	Commercial Car Park	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2004 \$240,000
33	5862	4	Moore Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P191285	2012 \$850,000
34	28	5	Wedge Street	Commercial	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2004 \$400,000
35	78	23	Richardson Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223065	2004 \$600,000
36	48	5	Edgar Street	ABC and Commercial	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223062	2012 \$2,310,000
37	339	63	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207852	2004 \$0
38	366	14	Howe Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P208153	2004 \$0
39	367	75	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P208153	2004 \$0
40	373	71	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P208153	2004 \$0
41	374	73	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P208153	2004 \$0
42	1	42	Kingsmill Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	SP40216	2011 \$845,000
43	317	51	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
44	318	53	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
45	319	55	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
46	321	36	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
47	322	59	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
48	323	57	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
49	337	46	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P163666	2004 \$0
50	338	61	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207852	2004 \$0
51	340	65	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207852	2004 \$0
52	341	67	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P208153	2004 \$0
53	394	77	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
54	395	79	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
55	396	81	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
56	397	83	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
57	398	85	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
58	399	87	Anderson Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P207899	2004 \$0
59	176	29	Morgans Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P223066	2004 \$0
60	2	60	Kingsmill Street	Vacant	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	SP45655	2011 \$900,000
61	3	55	Morgans Street	House	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	SP60376	2011 \$995,000
62	201	12	Edgar Street	House/Commercial	BHP BILLITON MINERALS PTY LTD, MITSUI-ITOCHU IRON	P70572	2011 \$0

Total 62 Properties

40 vacant properties